THREE

Symposium

Translated by Robert C. Bartlett

CHAPTER 1

(1) But[1] in my opinion, not only are the serious deeds of gentlemen[2] worth recalling, but so too are their deeds done in times of play. I wish to make clear those deeds at which I was present and on the basis of which I make this judgment.

(2) It was at the time of the horse race of the Great Panathenian[3] games. Callias the son of Hipponicus happened to be in love with the

I have used the text of François Ollier, *Banquet—Apologie de Socrate* (Paris: Société d'Édition, "Les Belles Lettres," 2d ed., 1972), by permission of Les Belles Lettres, Paris. As will become clear in the notes, I have been somewhat more reluctant than he to accept emendations proposed in the face of a consensus of the mss.

"Symposium" is simply a transliteration of the Greek title *sumposion;* it might be translated as "drinking party" or "banquet." The title appears in one ms. (D, Laurentianus LXXXV–9) as "Symposium of Xenophon the Orator."

[1] The dialogue begins with the word *alla* ("but," "rather") as though in mid-argument or in response to a previous speaker's contrary assertion (see J. D. Denniston, *Greek Particles,* 2d ed., [Oxford: Clarendon Press] *s.v., alla,* 2.8.i [p. 21]). The only other work of Xenophon to begin in this way is the *Constitution of the Lacedaemonians.*

[2] "Gentlemen" will always translate the phrase *kaloikagathoi [andres].* A more literal translation would be "noble and good [men]"; "gentlemanliness" could thus be translated as "nobility and goodness." *Kalos* by itself refers either to external beauty or to beauty of character; accordingly, it (and only it) will be rendered as "beautiful," "noble," or (in 1.4) "fine." The "beauty contest" in chapter 5 between Socrates and Critoboulus is therefore also a contest in "nobility."

[3] These took place every fourth year and were on a grander scale than the yearly games; they included not only the athletic competitions but sacrifices and a procession (see 8.40).

boy Autolycus and took him to the spectacle on the occasion of the latter's having won the pancratium.[4] When the race ended, he started off for his house in the Piraeus[5] with Autolycus and the boy's father; Niceratus too was accompanying him. (3) But when Callias saw Socrates as well as Critoboulus and Hermogenes and Antisthenes and Charmides standing together, he ordered someone to lead those with Autolycus onward, while he himself went over to Socrates and those with him and said, (4) "What a fine thing it is that I've happened upon you! You see, I'm about to give a feast for Autolycus and his father, and I think the setting would appear much more resplendent if the dining room were adorned with men whose souls have been purified, like yours, than it would be with generals, cavalry commanders, or those eager for[6] office."

(5) And Socrates said, "You're always making fun of us! You look down on us because, while you've paid a great deal of money to Protagoras for wisdom—and to Gorgias and Prodicus[7] and many others besides—you see that we're just self-taught in philosophy."

(6) And Callias said, "Well up till now, I've kept concealed from you that I can say many wise things. But now, if you come to my house, I'll show you that I am worthy of a very great seriousness."

(7) Now at first, Socrates and those with him thanked him for the invitation, as was fitting, but declined to join in the feasting. But as it became clear that he would become very annoyed should they not come along, they went with him. They then arrived at his house, some having in the meantime exercised and taken a rubdown, others also a bath. (8) Autolycus sat down beside his father, the others reclined as was fitting.

Someone would have immediately held, in considering what took place, that beauty is something regal by nature, especially if one possesses it together with bashfulness and moderation as was the case with Autolycus then. (9) For in the first place, just as when a light appears in the night and all eyes are led to it, so too was every-

[4] An all-out sport combining boxing and wrestling.

[5] The Piraeus is Athens' seaport, some five miles from the city.

[6] Literally, "serious about (political) office." It is related to the word translated in Xenophon's introductory remark as "seriousness" (*spoudēs*).

[7] Three well-known Sophists or rhetoricians, all of whom are portrayed in Plato's dialogues, above all in the *Protagoras* and the *Gorgias*; see also 4.62 and *Memorabilia* 2.1.21ff.

one's gaze then drawn toward Autolycus' beauty. Moreover, there was not an onlooker whose soul was unaffected by the boy in some way: some, at any rate, grew quiet, others also took on a sort of dignified pose. (10) Everyone under the sway of one of the gods is held to be worth beholding; but whereas those influenced by other gods are fiercer in appearance, more frightening in utterance, and carry themselves more vehemently, those inspired by the moderate Eros have eyes of a more kindly disposition, a gentler voice, and a mien more becoming liberality.[8] Such indeed characterized Callias at that time on account of Eros, making him worthy to be beheld by the initiates of this god.

(11) So they were feasting in silence, as though ordered to do so by some superior.[9] But Phillippus the jester then knocked at the door and told the porter to announce who he was and why he wished to be led in. He said that he'd come having made the appropriate preparations—so as to dine at another's expense. And he said that his slave-boy was very weary from what he was carrying—nothing—and from having missed his breakfast. (12) When Callias heard this, he said, "Well surely it's shameful, men, to begrudge him our hospitality. So let him in." And as he said this he looked toward Autolycus, evidently to ascertain what he thought of the quip.

(13) But Philippus, standing now in the room where the feast was taking place, said, "You all know that I am a jester. And I've come here eagerly, believing that it is funnier to come to a feast uninvited than invited."

"So recline," Callias said, "for those present, as you see, are full of seriousness and are perhaps rather in need of laughter."

(14) While they were dining, Philippus immediately tried to say something funny so that he might accomplish that for the sake of which he was always invited to feasts. But when he didn't incite anyone to laugh, he clearly grew annoyed. A little while later, he wanted to say something else funny, but when they didn't laugh at him then either, he stopped in the middle of the feast, covered himself up, and

[8] Liberality (*eleutherios*) generally speaking is behavior appropriate to a free man (*eleutheros*) and came to signify more narrowly the freedom from an undue attachment to wealth, i.e., generosity (see, e.g., 4.43 below and Aristotle *Nicomachean Ethics* 4.1).

[9] The adjective (*kreittōn*) can mean "better" because "stronger," an ambiguity the translation attempts to preserve. "Most excellent" will always be used to render the word in the superlative degree (*kratistos*), as in, e.g., 8.38–39.

laid down. (15) And Callias said, "What's this, Philippus? Are you in the grip of some pain?"

Groaning aloud he said, "Yes by Zeus, Callias! A great one! For since laughter has perished among human beings, my business has come to ruin. You see, before now, I was invited to feasts so that the guests[10] would be delighted by my making them laugh. But now, what reason is there to invite me, and who will do so? For I, at least, could no more be serious than become immortal. And nobody will invite me with the intention of being invited in return, since everyone knows there is no precedent[11] for having a feast at my house." And while he was saying this, he was wiping his nose and crying, as was clear from his voice. (16) Everyone was trying to reassure him that they would laugh next time, and were bidding him to feast, when Critoboulus burst out laughing at Philippus' lamentation. As soon as Philippus perceived Critoboulus' laughter, he uncovered himself, exhorted his soul to be confident, since there would be future engagements[12], and began to feast again.

Chapter 2

(1) When the tables had been taken away and they had poured a libation and sung a paean, a certain fellow[13] from Syracuse arrived for their entertainment. He had with him a good flute[14]-girl, a dancing girl—one of those capable of doing wondrous things—and a boy very much in the bloom of his youth able to play the harp[15] and dance very beautifully. The Syracusan made money by showing these off in performance. (2) When the flute-girl had played her flute

[10] Literally, "those who are together" (see n. 20 below).

[11] Literally, "principle" or "starting point" (*archēn*).

[12] Philippus uses a term that can refer to the contributions to a festival or common meal, to the meals themselves, or to encounters or "engagements" (in the hostile sense).

[13] Literally, "human being."

[14] The usual translation of the Greek, *aulos*. The aulos was in fact a double-reeded wind instrument more akin to the modern oboe than the flute.

[15] The word translated as "harp" (*cithara*) was an instrument somewhat akin to the modern harp, with eight to ten strings on a U-shaped frame backed by a tortoise shell sounding board.

for them and the boy his harp, and both were held to delight very competently, Socrates said, "By Zeus, Callias, you are putting on a perfect dinner! For not only have you provided a faultless feast, you are also furnishing the most pleasant sights and sounds."

(3) And the other said, "What then if someone brings us some perfume so that we may enjoy ourselves amidst pleasant odors as well?"

"No no!" said Socrates, "for you see, just as one kind of dress is beautiful for a woman and another for a man,[16] so too one fragrance is proper for a man and another for a woman. For doubtless no man anoints himself with perfume for the sake of a man. And indeed women—especially if they are brides, like Niceratus' here and Critoboulus'—what need do they have of additional perfume? (4) For they smell of it themselves. And the fragrance of the olive in the gymnasia is more pleasant to a woman when it is present than is perfume, and when absent she longs for it all the more. Indeed, everyone who is anointed with perfume, both slave and freeman, immediately smells alike. And the fragrances of the labors and practices characteristic of freedom require in the first place much time if they are to be pleasant and characteristic of freedom."[17]

And Lycon said, "Now these things might hold for the young, but for those of us who no longer exercise in the gymnasium, of what ought we to smell?"

"Of gentlemanliness, by Zeus!" said Socrates.

"And where might one lay hold of this scent?"

"Not, by Zeus," he said, "from the perfume peddlers!"

"But from where then?"

"Theognis said,

> For from the good you will be taught good things.
> But if you mingle with evil men,
> You will destroy even the intelligence you had."[18]

[16] The word (*anēr*) connotes a manly man, a "real man."

[17] The reading of the mss. Ollier's text, following Athenaeus, reads: "And the fragrances of the labors characteristic of liberality require in the first place upright practices over much time if they are to be pleasant and characteristic of liberality."

[18] See Theognis *Elegies* 35–36. The text as it has come down to us reads *mathēseai* ("you will learn"), although both Xenophon (see also *Memorabilia* 1.2.20) and Plato (*Meno* 95d 6) read *didakseai* ("you will be taught"). See J. Mitscherling, "Xenophon and Plato," *Classical Quarterly*, n.s. 32 (1982): 468–69.

(5) And Lycon said, "Do you hear this, son?"

"Yes, by Zeus," Socrates said, "and he makes use of it too! When, that is, he wished to carry off the prize for the pancratium, he considered with you [who would be able to teach him those things, and he associated with that man. Similarly, if he wishes to carry off the prize for virtue, he will consult with you][19] in turn as to who is in his opinion most capable in the practice of these things, and he'll associate[20] with him."

(6) At this point, many spoke out. Someone among them said, "Where then will he find a teacher of this?" Someone else said that this is not even teachable, another that this must be learned[21] above all else.

(7) And Socrates said, "Since this is disputable, let's put it off for another time and for now, let's finish off what is at hand. For I, at least, see that this dancing girl has taken her place and that some hoops have been brought to her."

(8) After this, the other girl began to play the flute for the dancer and someone standing beside her passed twelve hoops over to her. As she took them she danced and threw them spinning into the air, calculating how high she would have to throw them in order to catch them on the beat.

(9) And Socrates said, "It is clear, men, that in many other things as well as in what this girl is doing, the feminine nature is not at all inferior to the man's, but it lacks judgment[22] and strength. As a result, if someone among you has a wife, let him be confident in teaching her whatever he might want her to know in dealing with[23] her."

[19] There appears to be a lacuna in the text. I supply what I take to be missing.

[20] The verb (*suneinai*) has a range of meanings, from simply "being with" to "associating with" to "having sexual intercourse with" (for this latter, see, e.g., 4.57, 8.23). It will be translated as "associate with," but the extended meaning should be kept in mind.

[21] Reading *mathēteon* with the mss. rather than *mathēton* ("can be learned") with Ollier.

[22] Reading *gnōmēs* with the mss. instead of *rhōmēs* ("force" or "strength") with C. J. W. Mosche (*Oekonomikus, Apologie des Sokrates, Symposium und Hiero* [Frankfurt: Osterrieth, 1799]).

[23] The verb Socrates here uses (*chraomai*) has a wide range of meanings, including "to use" or "to make use of," "to deal with or treat," and even "to have sexual intercourse."

(10) And Antisthenes said, "How is it, then, Socrates, that while recognizing this, you too do not educate Xanthippe,[24] but deal with one who is the most difficult of present-day women and, I suppose, of those past and future too?"

"Because I see," he said, "that those who wish to become skilled horsemen acquire not the horses that readily obey, but high-spirited ones. For they believe that if they are able to subdue such horses, they will easily deal with[25] the rest. And I too, in my desire to deal and associate with human beings, have acquired her, knowing full well that if I can endure her, I'll easily associate with all other human beings."

And indeed this speech was held to have been spoken not wide of the mark.

(11) After this, a hoop was brought in, studded all-round with straight daggers. The dancing girl tumbled head first into and then through this in such a way that the onlookers were frightened lest she be hurt, but she performed this confidently and safely.

(12) And Socrates, calling to Antisthenes, said, "I suppose that at least those who see this will no longer dispute that even courage[26] is teachable, when she, though a woman, throws herself so daringly into the swords."

(13) And Antisthenes said, "Then wouldn't it be most excellent for the Syracusan here to show the city his dancing girl and to say that if the Athenians give him money, he'll make all Athenians dare to face the spear head-on?"

(14) And Philippus said, "Yes by Zeus! And I for my part would gladly watch Peisander the demagogue[27] learn how to tumble through daggers! As it is, he's not even willing to join the army on account of his inability to stare spears in the face!"

(15) After this, the boy danced, and Socrates said, "Did you see that although the boy is beautiful, nonetheless he seems still more beautiful with the dance routines than he does at rest?"

[24] Xanthippe was the wife of Socrates, renowned for her difficult behavior: see *Memorabilia* 2.2 and Diogenes Laertius *Lives of the Famous Philosophers* 2.36–37.

[25] See n. 23 above.

[26] Or, "manliness."

[27] Peisander was a leader of the Four Hundred, apparently notorious for his cowardice: see Aristophanes *Birds* 1555ff.

And Charmides said, "You seem to be praising the dance teacher."

(16) "Yes by Zeus!" said Socrates, "and I thought of something else in addition, that no part of his body was idle during the dance, but his neck, legs, and arms were exercised at the same time, just as one who intends to maintain his body in a good condition should dance. And I," he said, "would very gladly learn the routines from you, Syracusan."

And he said, "So what use will you make of them?"

(17) "I'll dance, by Zeus!"

At this everyone laughed. Socrates' face became very serious, and he said, "Are you laughing at me? Is it because I wish to exercise for better health, or for more pleasure in eating and sleeping, or because I am eager for such exercises—not like the long-distance runners who build up their legs but have scrawny shoulders, nor like the boxers who build up their shoulders but have scrawny legs—but by working every part of my body to create a complete equilibrium? (18) Or are you laughing because it won't be necessary for me to seek out an exercise partner, or to get undressed in a crowd—I'm an old man[28]—but a house big enough for seven couches will be sufficient for me, just as, even now, this room was sufficient for the boy here to work up a sweat? Is it because in winter I'll exercise inside and in shade when it is scorchingly hot? (19) Or are you laughing at this, that I have a bit of a paunch and wish to make it less? Or don't you know that just recently Charmides here caught me dancing at daybreak?"

"Yes by Zeus!" Charmides said. "And at first, at any rate, I was dumbstruck and feared that you were mad. But when I heard from you things similar to what you are saying now, I myself went home and, not danced—for I've never learned how—but did calisthenics, for this I knew how to do."

(20) "By Zeus," said Philippus, "and your legs and your shoulders are so equal in strength that, in my opinion, if you were to weigh your upper and lower halves for the Market Regulators, like loaves of bread, you'd get off scot-free!"[29]

And Callias said, "Socrates, summon me when you intend to learn how to dance so that I may be your partner and learn along with you."

[28] Or, "elder." The word "man" does not appear in the Greek (cf. n. 16 above).

[29] The Market Regulators weighed imported grain to insure against fraudulent dealings; see Plato *Laws* 760b, Aristotle *Politics* 1321b30 and context.

(21) "Come now," Philippus said, "let the flute be played for me as well so I too may dance!" And when he stood up, he went through the dances of the boy and girl and parodied them. (22) To begin with, since they had praised the way the boy seemed to be still more beautiful with his dance movements, Philippus replied in turn by making every part of his body that was in motion more laughable than it is by nature. And just as the girl had bent over backward in imitation of a wheel, so Philippus tried to do the same by bending over forward. Finally, as they had praised the boy because he exercised his whole body in his dance, Philippus bid the flute-girl to pick up the tempo and he let loose everything—legs, arms, and head. (23) When he was worn out, he reclined and said, "Here's proof, men, that my dance steps too supply exercise nobly. I'm thirsty, at any rate! Let the slave-boy fill a big drinking bowl for me!"

"By Zeus," Callias said, "and one for us, since we too are thirsty from laughing at you!"

(24) And Socrates in turn said, "Well, men, in my opinion it is very much the best thing to drink, for it really is the case that wine, by watering souls, puts pains to rest for some, just as mandragola does human beings, and it awakens affection in other souls, just as oil does the flame. (25) And yet it is my opinion too that men's[30] bodies[31] undergo the same things as do plants growing in the earth. For when the god waters them too much all at once, they also are unable to stand up straight or to breathe the morning air. But when they drink only so much as is pleasing, they will grow very straight, flourish, and arrive at the fruit-bearing stage.

(26) "Thus, if we too pour the drink all at once, our bodies and our minds will soon stagger, and we'll be unable to catch our breath, let alone say anything of substance. But if the slave-boys besprinkle our small cups with frequent little drops—to speak in Gorgian[32] phrases—in this way we won't be overpowered by the

[30] One ms. (E Laurentianus LXXX–13) and Athenaeus read "human beings' " rather than "men's."

[31] "Bodies" (*sōmata*) is the reading of Ollier's text, following Athenaeus (see also S. L. Radt, "Zu Xenophons *Symposion*" *Mnemosyne* 43 [1990]: 1–2, 24–5). The mss. (and Stobaeus *Florilegium*) read "banquets" (*sumposia*).

[32] The rhetorician Gorgias is meant (see n. 7 above). The form of the verb Socrates here uses (*epipsakadzōsin* instead of *epipsekadzōsin*) is found only in old Attic and is therefore somewhat affected, as the translation "besprinkle" attempts to suggest.

wine and get drunk, but rather we'll be coaxed into a greater playfulness."

(27) These things indeed seemed best to everyone.[33] But Philippus set it down in addition that the wine-servers ought to imitate the good charioteers by having the drinking cups go around faster. Indeed, this the wine-servers did.

Chapter 3

(1) After this the boy tuned his lyre to the flute and began to play and sing. At this everyone applauded, and Charmides said, "Well in my opinion, men, what Socrates said regarding the wine applies also to this mixing of youths in their bloom with music: on the one hand it lays pains to rest, and it awakens erotic passion[34] on the other."

(2) After this Socrates again spoke: "These people seem capable of pleasing us, men. But I know that we suppose we are very much better than they. Isn't it shameful, then, if we won't even try, when we are together[35], in some way to benefit or delight one another?"

Here many spoke: "Well then, you show us the way to the kinds of speeches that we might avail ourselves of and so best do this."

(3) He said, "I would most gladly have Callias fulfill his promise. For doubtless he said that if we should dine together, he would display his wisdom."

"And display it I will," he said, "if all of you too bring forward whatever good thing each one of you knows."

"Well no one opposes you in this," he said, "namely, our saying whatever it is each one of us believes to be the most valuable thing he knows."

(4) "I, then, " he[36] said, "say to you what it is I most pride myself on: I think that I am capable of making human beings better."

[33] Or, "These things were passed by everyone." Xenophon here speaks in legislative terms, beginning this sentence with the same formula used in the laws passed by the Athenian assembly ("It seems best to the people that . . ."). In the immediate sequel, Philippus makes an "amendment" to the "decree" just passed.

[34] Literally, "Aphrodite." Socrates had in fact not spoken of Aphrodite but rather of "affection" (see 2.24).

[35] See n. 20 above.

[36] The speaker is evidently Callias.

And Antisthenes said, "By teaching some vulgar art or gentlemanliness?"

"Gentlemanliness, if justice is this."

"By Zeus" said Antisthenes, "it, at least, is so most indisputably! For you see, there are times when courage and wisdom are held to be harmful to both friends and the city, but justice isn't intermingled with injustice in even a single respect."

(5) "When each of you has said what he has that is beneficial, then I too will unbegrudgingly[37] name that art through which I'm able to bring this about. But you say next, Niceratus," he said, "what sort of knowledge it is that you pride yourself on."

And he said, "My father[38] was concerned that I become a good man and so compelled me to learn all the lines of Homer. And now I could recite the whole *Iliad* and *Odyssey* by heart."

(6) "Has it escaped you," Antisthenes said, "that all the rhapsodes too know these verses?"

"How could it escape one who listens to them almost every day?"

"Do you know, then," he said, "of any tribe stupider than the rhapsodes?"

"No by Zeus," said Niceratus, "not in my opinion at least!"

"For it is clear," Socrates said, "that they do not know the hidden meanings. But you've paid a great deal of money to Stesimbrotus and Anaximander[39] and many others so that nothing of what is most worthwhile has escaped you. (7) Now what do you, Critoboulus, most pride yourself on?"

"On my beauty," he said.

"Then you too," Socrates said, "will be able to say that you are capable of making us better with your beauty?"

"If not, it's at any rate clear that I appear to be a good-for-nothing."

(8) "Now what about you," Socrates said, "what do you pride yourself on, Antisthenes?"

[37] That is, gladly or unrestrainedly. It is related to the verb "to bear a grudge" that appears at 3.14, 4.43, and 6.6.

[38] Niceratus is the son of the famed Athenian general, Nicias.

[39] Stesimbrotus was a biographer and Homeric scholar, fragments of whose writings survive. The Anaximander mentioned here is not the famous pre-Socratic philosopher but a Homeric critic; cf. Felix Buffière, *Les Mythes d'Homère et la Pensée Grecque* (Paris: Société d'Édition, "Les Belles Lettres," 1956), 132–33 and n. 30.

"On my wealth," he said. Hermogenes then asked whether he had a lot of money, and he swore that he had not even an obol.[40]

"Well do you possess a lot of land then?"

"Perhaps it might be enough for Autolycus here to dust himself with."[41]

(9) "We must listen to you too. And what about you, Charmides, what do you pride yourself on?" he said.

"I in turn pride myself on my poverty," he said.

"By Zeus," said Socrates, "that's a charming thing! For this indeed is least of all envied, least of all fought over, and is preserved when unguarded and strengthened when neglected!"

(10) "And you," said Callias, "what do you pride yourself on, Socrates?"

And Socrates, drawing up his face in a very solemn manner, said, "On pimping." When they laughed at him, he said, "You laugh, but I know that I would make a great deal of money should I wish to make use of this art."

(11) "As for you, Philippus," said Lycon, "it's clear that you pride yourself on making people laugh."

"More justly, I suppose, than does Callippides[42] the actor, who is overly pompous because he can make a packed house weep."

(12) "Surely you too, Lycon," said Antisthenes, "will say what it is you pride yourself on?"

"Why, don't you all know that it is on my son here?"

Someone said, "Well, it's clear that he, at least, prides himself on being the victor!"

Autolycus blushed and said, "No by Zeus, I don't!"

(13) Everyone then looked toward him, pleased at his having spoken. Someone asked him, "Well then, on what, Autolycus?"

He said, "On my father," and as he did so he nestled against him.

When Callias saw this he said, "Do you know, Lycon, that you are the wealthiest of human beings?"

"By Zeus," he said, "indeed I do not know this!"

[40] A small unit of Athenian currency, one-sixth of a drachma.

[41] It was the custom for athletes to rub down with oil and then fine sand or powder; see, e.g., H. A. Harris, *Greek Athletes and Athletics* (Westwood, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1979), 102–3.

[42] Callipides was a famous tragic actor.

"Well does it escape you that you wouldn't take the King's[43] money in place of your son?"

"I've been caught red-handed," he said, "being the wealthiest of human beings, as it seems!"

(14) "And you, Hermogenes," said Niceratus, "what do you exult in[44] most of all?"

And he said, "The virtue and power of my friends and that, being of this sort, they are concerned with me."

At this point everyone turned toward him, and many asked in unison whether he would make clear to them who these were. He said that he would not begrudge[45] doing so.

CHAPTER 4

(1) After this Socrates said, "Well then, it remains for us to demonstrate that the things each of us claimed really are worth a great deal."

"I'd like you to listen to me first," said Callias. "For all the while I hear you[46] being at a loss as to what the just is, I'm actually making human beings more just."

"How, best one?" he said.

"By giving them money, by Zeus!"

(2) And Antisthenes stood up and in a very refutative manner asked, "Callias, in your opinion, do human beings possess justice in their souls or in their wallets?"

"In their souls," he said.

"And so do you make their souls more just by putting money in their wallets?"

"Absolutely."

"How?"

"Since they know they'll have something with which to purchase the necessities, they don't wish to run the risk of committing crimes."

[43] The King of Persia is meant. The expression is proverbial (see also 4.11).

[44] The word Niceratus uses often has religious overtones. It appears only here in the *Symposium*.

[45] See n. 37 above.

[46] Callias here uses the plural "you."

(3) "And do they pay you back the money they receive?"

"By Zeus," he said, "no indeed!"

"What then, instead of the money, do they give you gratitude?"

"No by Zeus," he said, "not even this! Rather, some are even more hostile than before!"

"It's amazing!" Antisthenes said, looking at Callias as though he'd refuted him. "You're able to make them just toward others, but not toward you yourself?"

(4) "And why is this amazing?" Callias said. "Don't you see many carpenters and house-builders who construct houses for many others but are unable to build them for themselves and live instead in rented houses? So own up, you Sophist, that you've been refuted!"

(5) "By Zeus," said Socrates, "let him own up to it. For even the prophets are doubtless said to foretell the future for others, but not to foresee what will come for themselves."

(6) Here this speech came to a close.

After this Niceratus said, "I'd like you to hear from me too in what respects you'll be better if you associate with me. For doubtless you know that the most wise Homer has written about almost all human affairs. Whoever among you, then, wishes to become an expert household manager, public speaker, or general, or to become like Achilles, Ajax, Nestor, or Odysseus, let him pay court to me. For I understand all these things."

"Surely then you understand how to rule as a king," said Antisthenes, "since you know that he praised Agamemnon as a 'good king and strong spearman'?"[47]

"And yes by Zeus!" he said, "I for my part know that one driving a chariot must turn close to the post,

> And he himself must lean from the well-polished chariot board
> Gently to the left, and the horse on the right
> He must spur on and urge along, and slacken his hands to yield
> the reins.[48]

[47] *Iliad* 3.179.

[48] *Iliad* 23.335–37. The text as it has come down to us differs slightly from Niceratus' recitation. The humor of this citation apparently stems from the fact that chariot racing had become completely obsolete by this time.

(7) "I know something else in addition to this, and it is possible for you to test it immediately. For Homer says somewhere, 'an onion as a relish for the drink.'[49] Now if someone brings an onion, you will immediately be benefited very much in this, for you'll drink more pleasantly."

(8) And Charmides said, "Men, Niceratus wants to come home smelling of onions so his wife may believe that it didn't even enter anyone's head to kiss him!"

"By Zeus!" said Socrates, "but we run the risk of acquiring, I suppose, a ridiculous reputation as well. For the onion really does seem to be a relish, since it not only enhances the pleasure of food but that of drink too. Yet if we are going to nibble on this after dinner also, see to it that someone will not say we went to Callias' to overindulge."

(9) "Not at all, Socrates," he said. "For it is noble for one setting off to battle to nibble on an onion, just as some feed their cocks garlic before putting them together to fight. But perhaps we are deliberating as to how we'll kiss someone rather than do battle with him." (10) And somehow this speech came to a close.

Critoboulus said, "I then will speak next about the reasons why I pride myself on my beauty."

"Speak," they said.

"Well, if on the one hand I am not beautiful, as I suppose I am, then you would justly pay the penalty for the deception. For although no one administers an oath to you, you always swear and affirm that I am beautiful—and I trust in it, for I believe you are gentlemen. (11) Now if on the other hand I really *am* beautiful and you suffer the same things in regard to me as I do in regard to the one who is beautiful in my opinion, then I swear by all the gods that I wouldn't choose the King's empire in place of being beautiful. (12) For now I gave at Cleinias[50] with more pleasure than at all the other things that are beautiful among human beings; I would accept being

[49] *Iliad* 11.630.

[50] Cleinias is either the son or the cousin of Alcibiades and is evidently the object of Critoboulus' affections as related in *Mem.* 1.3.8–10. In Plato's *Euthydemus*, Cleinias is said to have a great many lovers or admirers (273a).

blind to all the rest before I would accept being blind only to Cleinias. I am burdened by the night and by sleep because I do not see him then, and I know the greatest gratitude to the day and to the sun because they reveal Cleinias to me.

(13) "It's a worthy thing indeed for us beautiful ones to pride ourselves on this too, that while the strong one must acquire good things by toiling, and the brave by running risks, and the wise by talking, the beautiful one can accomplish everything while being at leisure. (14) Now although I know that money is a pleasant possession, I, at least, would with greater pleasure give my property to Cleinias than I would receive more from another. I would with greater pleasure be a slave than a free man were Cleinias willing to rule me, for I would toil for him more easily than be at rest, and I would with greater pleasure run risks for him than live risk-free. (15) As a result, Callias, if you pride yourself on being able to make human beings more just, then I, in leading them to every virtue, am more just than you. For on account of what we instill in the lovers, we beautiful ones make them more liberal as regards money, fonder of hard work and noble action in dangers, and especially more bashful and continent, for they are abashed at the things that they want most of all. (16) Indeed, those who do not elect the beautiful as generals are mad. I, at least, would even go through fire with Cleinias, and I know that you would with me as well. So do not be at a loss any longer, Socrates, as to whether my beauty will benefit human beings.

(17) "And beauty ought not to be dishonored because it fades quickly, since just as a boy becomes beautiful, so too does a lad, a man, and an old man. There is proof of this: the beautiful elders are selected as Athena's olive-branch bearers, on the grounds that there is a beauty accompanying every age. (18) And if it is pleasant to have one's wants fulfilled by those who are willing, I know well that at this very moment I could, without saying a word, persuade this boy and the girl to kiss me more quickly than you could, Socrates, even if you were to say many wise things."

(19) "What's this?" said Socrates. "Do you make such boasts on the grounds that you are more beautiful even than I?"

"Yes by Zeus" said Critoboulus, "otherwise I would be the ugliest of all the Silenuses[51] in the satyr plays!" (Socrates did bear a resemblance to them.)[52]

(20) "Well then," said Socrates, "see to it that you remember the beauty contest when the speeches proposed have gone around. Let us be judged, not by Alexander[53] son of Priam, but by these very ones who, as you suppose, desire to kiss you."

(21) "Socrates," he said, "couldn't you entrust the matter to Cleinias?"

And he said, "Won't you stop bringing Cleinias to mind?"

"If I don't mention his name, do you suppose that I call him to mind any less? Don't you know that I have so clear an image of him in my soul that, if I were a sculptor or painter, I could produce a likeness of him no less from this image than from actually looking upon him?"

(22) And Socrates replied, "Why then, if you have so lifelike an image, do you burden me with these matters and drag me around to where you will see him?"

"Because, Socrates, while the sight of him is capable of delighting me, seeing his image does not supply pleasure but rather instills longing in me."

(23) And Hermogenes said, "Well I, Socrates, do not think it at all appropriate for you to overlook Critoboulus' being so dumbstruck by love."

"Is it your opinion that it is after his associating with me that he is so disposed?"

"Well when, then?"

"Don't you see that the down of his beard is just now descending alongside his ears, but that Cleinias already has hair creeping along the nape of his neck? It was when he went to the same school as Cleinias that Critoboulus became so vehemently inflamed with de-

[51] Silenuses were creatures, half-horse (or goat) and half-man, usually old, and given to mischief. They were apparently portrayed also as old drunkards, though not without intellectual talents: the education of Dionysus was entrusted to them.

[52] Xenophon's comment here is considered suspect by some editors but is present in the mss.

[53] Alexander, or Paris, was called on to judge the beauty of Hera, Athena, and Aphrodite (cf. *Iliad* 24.28–30; Euripides *Helen* 23–30).

sire. (24) Because his father perceived this, he entrusted him to me, hoping I might be able to benefit him in some way.

"He is in any case much better already. For before, like those who gaze upon the Gorgons,[54] Critoboulus stared at him with a stony gaze and, like a stone,[55] did not leave him for any reason. (25) But now I've already seen him blink! And yet, by the gods, men, it is my opinion at least," he said, "that—just between ourselves[56]—he has even kissed Cleinias. There is no more fearsome a spark of love than this, for it is insatiable and supplies certain sweet hopes. (26) Perhaps it is overly honored because, of all acts, only touching one another with the lips[57] has the same name as the love belonging to souls.[58] This is why I assert it is necessary for one who will be capable of moderation to abstain from the kisses of those in their bloom."

(27) And Charmides said, "But why in the world, Socrates, do you spook us, your friends, away from the beautiful ones in this way, when I saw you yourself—yes, by Apollo!—when both you and Critoboulus were searching for something in the same book at the gymnasium, your head against his head, your bare shoulder against his bare shoulder?"

(28) "Ah hah!" he said. "So that's why, like someone who'd been bitten by a wild beast, I felt a pain in my shoulder for more than five days and why I thought there was something like a sting in my heart! But now, Critoboulus, I proclaim before all these witnesses that you are not to lay hold of me until your beard is as long as the hair on your head!"

(29) And in this way they mixed the playful and serious.

[54] Gorgons were mythical creatures the sight of which turned men to stone: *Odyssey* 11.634–35.

[55] The adverb this phrase translates (*lithinōs*) is omitted by Ollier but is present in the mss.

[56] Reading, with Ollier, the *hēmin autois* ("ourselves") of Leonclavius (*Xenophontis Opera* [Frankfurt, 1569]).

[57] Reading, with Ollier, the emendation *stomasi* instead of *sōmasi* ("bodies") with the mss.

[58] The same verb (*philein*) means both to kiss and to love unerotically or as a friend. The sentence is omitted by Ollier, following Dindorf (*Xenophontis Opera* [Leipzig: B. G. Teubner, 1852–54]), but is present in the mss. Cf. Pierre Gorisson, "Notes sur le *Banquet* de Xénophon," in *Recueil commemoratif du xe anniversaire de la Faculté de Philosophie et Lettres* (Louvain: Editions Nauwaerts, 1968), 171–82.

Then Callias said, "It's your turn, Charmides, to say why you pride yourself on poverty."

"Surely it's agreed to," he said, "that it is better[59] to be bold than fearful, to be free rather than a slave, to be tended to rather than to tend to another, and to be trusted by the fatherland rather than distrusted by it. (30) Now when I was a wealthy man in this city, in the first place I used to fear that someone would break into my house, steal my money, and do some evil to my very person. Second, I used to tend to the sycophants,[60] knowing that I was more capable of suffering at their hands than making them do so at mine. Moreover, some expense was always assigned to me by the city, and I wasn't able to travel abroad. (31) But now, as I am deprived of my properties abroad and do not reap the benefits from those at home, and my household goods have been sold, I stretch out and sleep pleasantly, I have become trusted by the city, and no longer am I threatened but rather I now threaten others; I am also permitted as a free man both to travel abroad and to return home. And now the wealthy rise out of their seats and make way for me in the streets; (32) now I am akin to a tyrant, but then I clearly was a slave. Then too I used to pay taxes to the people, but now the city supports me at its expense. And when I was wealthy, they used to reproach me because I associated with Socrates, but now that I have become poor, it's no longer of any concern to anyone. Further, when I had a lot, I always used to lose something, either on account of the city or through chance. But now I lose nothing, for I have nothing to lose, and I always hope that I'll lay hold of something."

(33) "Well then," said Callias, "do you pray never to become wealthy, and if you see some good vision in your sleep, do you sacrifice to the gods that avert evil?"

"By Zeus no!" he said. "*This* I do not do, but I bear up with a real love of danger if I expect to lay hold of something from somewhere or other."

(34) "But come now," Socrates said, "you tell us in turn, Antisthenes, how it is that, having so little, you pride yourself on wealth."

[59] Or "superior," "stronger" (*kreittōn*); see n. 9 above.

[60] Or, "extortioners." Strictly speaking, sycophants were those who threatened to bring formal judicial actions against (wealthy) citizens unless they received a payoff (see *Memorabilia* 2.9, and *Oeconomicus* 11.21).

"Because I believe, men, that human beings do not have wealth and poverty in their household but in their souls. (35) For I see many private persons who, although they have a great deal of wealth, believe they are so poor that they take on every toil and every danger to possess more. I also know brothers each of whom received an equal inheritance, but the one now has enough, and even more than enough, for his expenses, while the other is in need of everything. (36) I perceive also that some tyrants are so hungry for money that they do things far more terrible than the destitute. Doubtless it is because of want that some of these latter steal, others burgle houses, and that still others ply the slave trade. But there are some tyrants who do away with whole households, slaughter masses, and often sell even entire cities into slavery for the sake of money. (37) Now I for my part feel great pity for them because of their extremely harsh sickness. For in my opinion they suffer the same things as someone who could never be satiated although he had and ate a great deal. But I have so much that I myself can scarcely find it all.[61] Nevertheless, I can eat to the point that I'm not hungry and can drink until I'm not thirsty and be dressed in such a way that I'm no colder when outside than the fabulously wealthy Callias here. (38) When I am indoors, the walls are in my opinion very warm cloaks, the ceilings very thick mantles. The bedding I have is so adequate that it is a great task just to wake up. If my body ever requires sexual pleasure,[62] whatever is near to hand is so satisfactory to me that those women whom I visit welcome me most warmly because no one else is willing to go to them. (39) Now all these things are so pleasant in my opinion that in doing each of them I would not pray to be more pleased, but less—some of them being in my opinion more pleasant than is beneficial.

(40) "The most valuable possession in my wealth I reckon to be this, that if someone were to take from me all that I now have, I see no task so base that it would not be sufficient to provide my sustenance. (41) For whenever I wish to experience pleasure, I do not buy precious things from the marketplace—for they are expensive—but I dispense things from my soul. And it makes a much greater differ-

[61] Reading *aneuriskō* as suggested by G. L. Cooper, "A Better Solution for the Text of Xenophon, *Symp.* 4.37" *Classical Quarterly* 21 (1971): 62–63.

[62] Literally, "the things (or pleasures) belonging to Aphrodite"; cf. 3.1, end.

ence in regard to pleasure when I lay before me what was lacking after I've endured a wait than when I consume some precious thing, just as now I drink this Thasian wine that I've happened upon, although I'm not thirsty. (42) And indeed it is likely that those who look to cheap things are more just, at least, than those who seek out expensive things, for those who are satisfied by what is near to hand least covet what belongs to others. (43) It is also worthwhile to consider that such wealth makes people liberal. For Socrates here, from whom I acquired this wealth, did not come to my aid calculating the number or weight of the goods involved, but gave over to me so much as I could carry. Now I too begrudge no one, but make a display to all my friends of my unbegrudging plenty[63] and share the wealth of my soul with anyone who so desires. (44) Moreover, you see that the most exquisite possession, leisure, is always available to me so that I can behold the worthiest sights, listen to the worthiest sounds and, what I value most, spend the day at leisure with Socrates. He too does not marvel at[64] those who rack up the most gold, but he rather spends his days associating with those who are pleasing to him."

Thus did he speak.

(45) Callias said, "By Hera! Among the reasons why I envy your wealth is that the city doesn't command you and treat you like a slave, and that human beings don't become angry if you don't loan them money."

"But by Zeus," said Niceratus, "don't envy him! For I'm going to visit him with the intention of borrowing this capacity to be self-sufficient. Having been taught by Homer to count,

> Seven unfired tripods, ten talents of gold
> Twenty blazing cauldrons, and twelve horses[65]

by weight and number, I never stop desiring the greatest wealth possible. On the basis of this, perhaps I am too fond of money in the opinion of some."

[63] See n. 37 above.
[64] Or, "admire."
[65] *Iliad* 11.122f., 264f.

At this everyone laughed, believing that he had said what was indeed the case.[66]

(46) After this someone said, "It's your task, Hermogenes, to say who your friends are and to show both that they are capable of great things and that they care for you; in this way you may be held to take pride in them justly."

(47) "Well now, it is quite clear that both Greeks and barbarians believe the gods know everything, both what is[67] and what will be. All cities, at any rate, and all nations ask the gods, by means of divination, what they ought to do and what not. And indeed, that we believe they are capable of doing good and bad is clear as well. At any rate all ask the gods to avert wretched things and grant the good. (48) So you see, these gods who know all things and are able to do all things are my friends in such a way that, through their care for me, I have never yet escaped their notice, night or day, wherever I may be setting off or in whatever I may be about to do. Through their foreknowledge of what will result from every action, they signify to me whatever I must do and what I ought not by sending me voices, dreams, and birds of omen as messengers. Whenever I obey them, I have never yet repented of it; but now and again when I failed to believe them, I was punished."

(49) And Socrates said, "Well there is nothing unbelievable in these things. Yet I for my part would gladly learn how it is that you tend to them and thus have them as friends."

"By Zeus," said Hermogenes, "very inexpensively! For I praise them but spend no money; I always offer up something from what they give me; I speak as piously[68] as I can; and I never wittingly lie when I have invoked them as witnesses."

"By Zeus," said Socrates, "if you, being of this sort, have them as friends, the gods too, it seems, are pleased by gentlemanliness!"

(50) This speech was thus delivered seriously.

When they came to Philippus, they asked him what he saw in jesting that he prided himself on. "Isn't it a worthwhile thing?" he said.

[66] Literally, "the things that exist," "the beings" (*ta onta*).

[67] Literally, "the things that exist," "the beings" (see the preceding note).

[68] Radt, "Zu Xenophons *Symposion*," 27, argues that the verb Hermogenes here uses (*euphēmeō*) has its idiomatic meaning, "to hush up," "to keep quiet" (see, e.g., Plato *Euthydemus* 301a7; *Symposium* 214d5) and would accordingly shed some light on Hermogenes' subsequent reluctance to speak (6.1–4).

"Everyone knows that I am a jester, and they eagerly invite me to these affairs when they are in a good way, but take to their heels and never look back when they're dealt something bad, afraid that they may laugh unwittingly."

(51) And Niceratus said, "By Zeus, you do justly pride yourself! For some of my friends, in turn, keep out of my path when they are faring well, but others, if they are dealt something bad, trace their family roots to me and never leave my side!"

(52) "Well now. What about you, Syracusan," said Charmides, "what do you pride yourself on? Or is it clear that it is on your boy?"

"No by Zeus," he said, "no indeed! But I am very much afraid for him: I sense that certain persons are plotting to corrupt[69] him."

(53) When Socrates heard this, he said, "Heracles! How great an injustice do they suppose has been done by your boy such that they want to kill him?"

"They don't want to kill him," he said, "but to persuade him to sleep with them."

"You, as it seems, believe that if this should happen, he would be corrupted?"

"Yes by Zeus," he said, "in every respect!"

(54) "Then you yourself don't sleep with him?"

"Yes by Zeus—all night every night!"

"By Hera," said Socrates, "what great good fortune for you that your skin is of such a nature that it alone doesn't corrupt those with whom you sleep! It's a worthy thing, as a result, for you to pride yourself on your skin, if nothing else!"

(55) "But by Zeus I don't pride myself on that!" he said.

"But on what, then?"

"By Zeus, on fools! For they support me by coming to see my puppet shows."

"So that's why," Philippus said, "I heard you praying yesterday to the gods for them to give you, wherever you may be, an abundant harvest, but a dearth of the sensible."

[69] Or, "destroy," as Socrates seems to suppose in the immediate sequel. The same verb was used in the formal charge against Socrates of having "corrupted" the young: see *Memorabilia* 1.1.1; cf. also *Symp.* 5.10, end.

(56) "Well now," said Callias. "As for you, Socrates, what do you have to say that makes it a worthy thing for you to pride yourself on such an ill-reputed art as the one you mentioned?"

And he said, "Let us agree in the first place what sorts of things the pimp's tasks are. And don't shrink from answering all that I ask, so we may know how much we agree on. Does this seem best to you all?" he said.

"Certainly," they said. And when once they had began to say, "Certainly," they all said this in reply to what followed.

(57) "In your opinion," he said, "isn't it the task of the good pimp to display the woman or the man being pimped in a way pleasing to those with whom he or she may be together?"

"Certainly," they said.

"Surely one way to please is the appropriate arrangement of hair and clothing?"

"Certainly," they said.

(58) "And surely we know this too, that it is possible for a human being to look at someone in both a friendly and a hateful way using the same eyes?"

"Certainly," they said.

"What then? Is it possible also to speak bashfully and boldly using the same voice?"

"Certainly," they said.

"What then? Don't some speeches cause hatred, but some lead to friendship?"

"Certainly."

(59) "Surely, then, of these things, the good pimp would teach what is advantageous with a view to pleasing?"

"Certainly," they said.

"Who would be better," he said, "the pimp able to make them pleasing to one person or the pimp who could make them pleasing to many?"

At this point, however, they were divided: some said, "Clearly whoever could make them pleasing to the most"; others simply said, "Certainly."

(60) Saying that this too was agreed on, Socrates continued: "If someone were able to show them off in a manner pleasing to the entire city, would he not then be an altogether good pimp?"

"Clearly so, by Zeus!" they all said.

"Then if such a one were able to bring this about from among those he manages, wouldn't he justly pride himself on his art and justly receive a great deal of money?"

(61) When all agreed to this, he said, "And indeed in my opinion, Antisthenes is such a one."

And Antisthenes said, "Is it to me, Socrates, that you are handing over your art?"

"Yes by Zeus!" he said. "For I see that you have also practiced well the art attendant upon mine."

"What's that?"

"The art of the go-between[70]," he said.

(62) Becoming very angry, Antisthenes asked, "And what do you know, Socrates, of my having done such a thing?"

"I know," he said, "that you have acted as a go-between for Callias here and the wise Prodicus, when you saw the former in love with philosophy and the latter in need of money. And I know that you brought him together also with Hippias the Elean[71] from whom he learned his skill in memorization. It is indeed on account of this that Callias has become more skilled in erotic matters, for he never forgets anything beautiful he sees.

(63) "And doubtless it was just recently that, by praising the Heraclean stranger[72] to me, you made me desire him and introduced him to me. I certainly am grateful to you, for he is in my opinion very much the gentleman. And by praising Aeschylus the Phliasian[73] to me, and me to him, didn't you arrange it in such a way that, being in love because of your speeches, we sought out one another like dogs on a hunt? (64) Having seen that you are capable of doing these things well, then, I believe you are a good go-between. For one who is capable of recognizing those who are beneficial to one another[74] and can make these desire one another, this man would in my opinion be capable also of making cities friends and of bringing together suitable

[70] Or, "procurer." As Antisthenes' reaction makes clear, the connotations of this word are altogether disreputable.

[71] A Sophist, after whom Plato named two dialogues. See also *Memorabilia* 4.4.5ff.

[72] It is not known to whom Socrates here refers.

[73] Nothing is known of this figure.

[74] Reading, with Ollier, *hautois* as proposed by Leonclavius (*Xenophontis Opera* [Frankfurt, 1569]) instead of *autōi* ("to himself") of the mss.

spouses, and would be a very worthy possession to cities, friends, and allies.[75] But you got angry, as though you had heard yourself spoken of badly when I said that you are a good go-between."

"But by Zeus," he said, "I'm not so now. For if I can do these things, my soul shall be overloaded with riches in every respect." And this round of the speeches came to a close.

Chapter 5

(1) Callias said, "Now you, Critoboulus, aren't you holding out on the beauty contest against Socrates?"

"Yes, by Zeus, he is," said Socrates, "for perhaps he now sees that the pimp is well thought of by the judges!"

(2) "Even so," said Critoboulus, "I'm not backing out. So instruct us, if you have something wise to say, as to how you are more beautiful than I. Just let someone bring the lamp up close," he said.

"Well then," Socrates said, "first I summon you to the examination[76] of the court. So answer."

"Just ask."

(3) "Do you believe that the beautiful exists only in a human being, or in something else as well?"

"By Zeus," he said, "I say that it is also in a horse, an ox, and many inanimate things. I know, at any rate, that a shield is beautiful, as well as a sword and a spear."

(4) "And how is it that although none of these is similar to the other, they are all beautiful?"

"If, by Zeus," he said, "they've been well wrought with a view to the tasks for which we acquire them, or if they've been well adapted by nature with a view to the things we need, then these," Critoboulus said, "are beautiful."

[75] The phrase "and allies" (*kai summachois*) is suspected by many and is deleted by Ollier, following Sauppe (*Xenophontis Opera* [Leipzig: B. Tauchnitz, 1865–66]). Gorissen, "Notes sur le *Banquet*," 184–85, suggests "spouses" (*suggamois*).

[76] This is a technical legal term referring to the magistrates' examination of persons involved in a suit prior to their coming to trial.

(5) "Do you know for the sake of what we need eyes?"

"That's clear," he said, "in order to see."

"So then already my eyes would be more beautiful than yours."

"How so?"

"Because yours only see straight ahead, but mine, because they bulge out, see to the sides as well."

"Do you mean," he said, "that the crab has the best eyes of all the animals?"

"Doubtless in every respect," he said, "since he has by nature the best eyes also with a view to strength."

(6) "Well," he said, "which nose is more beautiful, yours or mine?"

"I think mine is," he said, "if in fact the gods made our nostrils for the sake of smelling. For yours look down to the ground, but mine flare upwards so they can receive smells from everywhere."

"How is the flat nose more beautiful than the straight?"

"Because," he said, "it doesn't block the eyes, but rather allows them immediately to see whatever they wish. A high nose, as if in insolent opposition, builds a wall between the eyes."

(7) "As for the mouth," Critoboulus said, "I concede the point. For if it has been made for the sake of biting, you could bite off something much bigger than I could. And because of the thickness of your lips, don't you suppose that your kiss would be the softer?"

"It seems," Socrates said, "that, according to your argument, I have an uglier mouth than that of an ass! But do you reckon it to be no proof of my being more beautiful than you that the River Nymphs, being goddesses, give birth to the Silenuses who bear a greater resemblance to me than to you?"

(8) And Critoboulus said, "I'm no longer able to speak against you. Let them distribute the ballots so that I may know as quickly as possible what I must either suffer or pay. Just let them vote in secret," he said, "for I'm afraid that the wealth you and Antisthenes have may overpower me."

(9) The girl and the boy cast their votes in secret. Meanwhile Socrates saw to it both that the lamp was brought around in turn to Critoboulus, in order for the judges not to be deceived, and that the victor's wreath would not be a fillet but kisses from the judges. (10) When the votes had been turned out and all were in Critoboulus' favor, Socrates said, "Ah well! It seems that your money, Crito-

boulus, isn't similar to Callias'. For his makes people more just, but yours, like most, is capable of corrupting both jurors and judges."

Chapter 6

(1) After this, some bade Critoboulus to take his victory kisses, some bade him to ask for the permission of[77] the youths'[78] master, and others made other jokes. But here too Hermogenes was silent. Socrates called him by name and said, "Could you tell us, Hermogenes, what 'convivial misbehavior' is?"

And he replied, "If you are asking what it is, I don't know. Yet I might be able to say what it seems to me to be."

"Well, state what it seems to be," he said.

(2) " 'To give pain, under the influence of wine, to one's companions,' this is what I judge 'convivial misbehavior' to be."

"Then don't you know," he said, "that you are now giving pain to us by being silent?"

"Do you mean when you are talking?"

"No, but when we leave gaps in our talking."

"What? Has it escaped your attention that someone could not get even a hair in edgewise, let alone a word?"

(3) And Socrates said, "Callias, could you come to the aid of a man being refuted?"

"Indeed I can," he said. "For whenever the flute is sounded, we are altogether silent."

And Hermogenes said, "Do you wish, then, that, just as Nicostratus the actor used to recite tetrameters along with the flute, so I too should converse with you all accompanied by the flute?"

(4) And Socrates said, "In the name of the gods, Hermogenes, do so. For I suppose that, just as the song is more pleasant with the flute, so too your speeches would be made pleasant in some way by the sounds, especially if you should gesticulate, like the flute-girl, while you speak."

[77] Literally, "to persuade."

[78] Only the word "master" appears in the Greek and probably refers, as the translation suggests, to the Syracusan.

(5) And Callias said, "Whenever Antisthenes here refutes someone at the banquet, what will be the tune?"

And Antisthenes said, "I think that hissing[79] would be fitting for the one being refuted."

(6) Such were the speeches being given when the Syracusan saw that they were neglecting his shows and taking pleasure in one another. Being envious of[80] Socrates, he said, "Are you, Socrates, the one nicknamed the 'Thinker'?"[81]

"Surely that would be nobler than if I were called the 'Thoughtless.' "

"Unless, that is, you were held to be a thinker of the things aloft."

(7) "Do you know anything loftier than the gods?"

"But by Zeus," he said, "they say that you do not care about them, but about the least beneficial things."

"Surely in this way too," he said, "I would care about the gods: just existing[82] they do benefit from on high, and from on high they furnish light.[83] And if what I say falls flat, you are to blame," he said, "for giving me these troubles."

(8) "Well then, let it be. But tell me how many flea's feet you are from me. For they say you measure these things."[84]

And Antisthenes said, "You are clever, Philippus, at doing caricatures.[85] Doesn't this man in your opinion take after one wanting to be abusive?"

"Yes by Zeus, he does," Philippus said, "and after many others too!"

(9) "But nevertheless," Socrates said, "don't do a caricature of him, lest you too take after someone wanting to be abusive."

[79] This refers also to the sound of a shepherd's pipe.

[80] Or, "Bearing a grudge against . . ."

[81] The Syracusan here alludes to Aristophanes' *Clouds* (see lines 266 and 414; also 94), first performed in 423 B.C. (see n. 9 to the interpretive essay, this work).

[82] Reading *ontes* with the mss. instead of the conjecture, *huontes* ("raining") accepted by Ollier. For a defense of the mss., see L. Parmentier, "Xénophon, *Banquet*, 6.7," *Revue de l'instruction publique en Belgique* 1 (1900): 244.

[83] Socrates' reply contains an untranslatable pun, made up of the components of the word used by the Syracusan to charge that Socrates is concerned with the least beneficial things: *tōn anōphelestatōn*. Socrates replies that the gods benefit (*ōphelousin*) from on high (*anōthen*).

[84] See Aristophanes *Clouds* 144ff.

[85] Comic imitation of others was a customary form of entertainment at banquets.

"But if in fact I compare him in my caricature to all the finest gentlemen,[86] someone would justly compare me to one who praises rather than abuses."

"Even now you seem to take after one who abuses, if you say that everyone is better than he."[87]

(10) "But do you want me to liken him to those who are more wretched?"

"Not to those who are more wretched either."

"But to nobody?"

"Don't liken him to a nobody either."[88]

"But if I keep quiet, I don't know how I'll make myself deserving of the dinner!"

"That's easy," he said, "if you keep quiet about the things one ought not say."

Thus this convivial misbehavior was quenched.

Chapter 7

(1) After this, some of the others continued to bid Philippus to do a caricature, but others continued to prevent him. Amidst this uproar, Socrates again spoke: "Since we all wish to speak, wouldn't it be best now for us to sing together?" As soon as he said this, he began a song. (2) After he[89] had sung, a potter's wheel was brought in for the dancing girl, on which she was to perform some wondrous feats. At this point Socrates said, "Syracusan, it is likely[90], just as you say, that I really am a thinker. Right now, at any rate, I'm considering how your boy here and this girl may spend their time as easily as possible, and

[86] Literally, "the noble and best," a slight variation on the customary formula (see n. 2 above).

[87] Reading *beltiō* rather than *beltiōn* with the mss. ("if you say that you are better than he in all respects"). Ollier reproduces Marchant's suggestion (itself inspired in part by an earlier emendation of Leonclavius) which would read as follows: "if you say that all things are better than he."

[88] Following the reading of the mss. and the translation suggested by Gorissen, "Notes sur le *Banquet*," 185–86.

[89] Reading *ēsen* with the mss. instead of Mosche's *ēsan* ("they had sung").

[90] Literally, "I run the risk of being" (*kinduneuō*).

how we may be especially delighted in watching them—what I know well you too want. (3) In my opinion, leaping into daggers is an exhibition of danger, something not at all appropriate to a banquet. Moreover, reading and writing on a spinning wheel may be something of a wonder, but I can't understand what pleasure even these things would supply. Nor is watching those who are beautiful and in bloom twisting around their bodies and imitating wheels more pleasant than watching them at rest. (4) For indeed, it is nothing very rare to happen upon wondrous things, if someone is wanting in these. It is possible to wonder very much and without delay at what is near to hand: why in the world does the lamp supply light by having a brilliant flame, while brass, which is brilliant as well, does not produce light but reflects off itself images of other things? And how is it that oil, while being wet, increases the flame, but water, because it is wet, extinguishes the fire? But these things too do not urge one on to the same thing as does wine. (5) If they were to dance routines depicting the Graces, the Seasons, and the Nymphs to the accompaniment of the flute, I think they would spend their time more easily and the banquet would be much more agreeable."

The Syracusan then said, "But by Zeus, Socrates, you speak nobly, and I'll bring in performances that will please you all!"

CHAPTER 8

(1) The Syracusan withdrew to prepare himself,[91] and Socrates in turn began a new speech. "Well, men," he said, "when a great daimon is present, one that is equal in age to the everlasting gods but youngest in appearance, one that extends over all things in its magnitude but is equivalent to[92] the human soul—I mean Eros—isn't it

[91] Radt ("Zu Xenophons *Symposion*," 28) argues that the verb usually translated as "was applauded" should be taken in the middle rather than the passive voice and that it accordingly means to practice or prepare oneself. This accords with the Latin translation of Leonclavius (1569) as well as the German of G. P. Landmann (*Das Gastmahl* [Hamburg: Rowohlt, 1957]).

[92] Reading *isoumenou* with the mss. instead of the conjecture *hidroumenou* ("seated" or "dwelling in") accepted by Ollier. H. Richards, "Notes on the *Symposium* of Xenophon," *Classical Review* 16 (1902): 294, suggests *eisduomenou* ("enters into").

fitting for us not to forget Him, especially when we are all fellow-worshippers[93] of this god? (2) For I cannot mention a time in my life when I wasn't in love with someone,[94] and I know that Charmides here possesses many lovers and that there are some whom he himself has desired. Critoboulus, who is at present still a beloved, already desires others. (3) Moreover, Niceratus too, as I hear, loves his wife and is loved in return. And as for Hermogenes, who among us doesn't know that he is melting away with love of gentlemanliness, whatever in the world it may be? Don't you see how serious are his brows, how steady his eye, how measured his speeches, how gentle his voice, how cheerful his character? And although he associates with the most august[95] gods as friends, don't you see that he doesn't feel contempt for us human beings? Are only you, Antisthenes, not in love with anyone?"

(4) "By the gods," he said, "I am very much so—with you!"

Socrates said, jokingly and coyly, "Don't bother me right now; (5) you see I've other things to do."

And Antisthenes said, "How clear it is that you are always doing such things, you pimp of yourself! At one time you fail to converse with me, using your *daimonion*[96] as an excuse, at another time you claim that you're seeking out someone[97] else."

(6) And Socrates said, "In the name of the gods, Antisthenes, just don't thrash me! The rest of your harshness I bear and will continue to bear in a friendly way. But let us cover over your love since it is not of my soul but of my nice form.

(7) "That you, Callias, love Autolycus the whole city knows, as do, I think, many foreigners too. The reason for this is that both of your fathers are renowned, and you yourselves are well known. (8) I for my part always used to admire your nature, but I do so now much more, since I see that you are in love with one who is not delicate through luxuriousness or effeminate through softness, but with one

[93] Strictly speaking, the "worshippers" here (*thiasōtai*) are those who belong to a *thiasos*, a religious association devoted to the worship of a particular divinity or divinities.

[94] Or, "something."

[95] Or, "solemn."

[96] Socrates' "daimon" or divine voice: see n. 5 to the translation of the *Apology of Socrates to the Jury*, this work.

[97] Or, "something."

who displays to all his strength, endurance, courage, and moderation. Desiring such things is a sure sign of the nature of the beloved.[98]

(9) "Now whether Aphrodite is single or dual, Heavenly and Vulgar, I don't know. For even Zeus, who is held to be the same, has many names. But I do know, at least, that there are separate altars and temples for each, as well as separate sacrifices—the Vulgar Aphrodite's being the more impure, the Heavenly's the more chaste. (10) You might conjecture that the Vulgar Aphrodite sends the loves of the bodies, the Heavenly one the loves of the soul, of friendship, and of noble deeds. Indeed, Callias, it is by this latter sort of Eros that you are in my opinion restrained. (11) I offer as evidence of this the gentlemanliness of your beloved and that I see you invite his father to your get-togethers[99] with the boy. For none of these is concealed from the father by the lover who is a gentleman."

(12) And Hermogenes said, "By Hera, Socrates! I admire, among many other things about you, that you are now gratifying Callias even as you are teaching him the sort of person he ought to be."

"Yes by Zeus," he said, "and so that he may be delighted still more, I wish to bear witness to him that the love of the soul is much superior to that of the body. (13) For we all know that there is no association with[100] another worthy of any account in the absence of friendship. The friendly love, at any rate, of those who admire the character is called a private[101] and voluntary compulsion,[102] but many of those who desire the body blame and despise the ways of the beloved. (14) Even if both[103] feel affection, doubtless the bloom of youth soon fades, and when this is absent, the friendship necessarily fades and dies along with it. But for so long as the soul approaches greater prudence, it also becomes worthier of love. (15)

[98] Reading *erōmenou* ("of the beloved") with the mss. rather than Mosche's *erastou* ("of the lover"). A papyrus fragment, apparently from the 2d century A.D. (Ollier, *Banquet-Apologie de Socrate*, 36), reads "*erōtos*" ("of Eros"). According to the reading of some mss., the phrase might also be rendered, "Desiring such things is a sure sign also of the nature of the beloved."

[99] See n. 20 above.

[100] See n. 20 above.

[101] Reading *idia* ("private") with the mss. instead of the conjecture *hēdeia* ("pleasant") accepted by Ollier.

[102] Literally, "necessity." The word can also refer to the bonds of kinship.

[103] The reading of the mss., defended by Radt, "Zu Xenophons *Symposion*," 29–30. Ollier's text reads: "Even if they feel affection for both [the body and the soul], . . ."

Moreover, there is in the use of the bodily form a certain satiety, the result of which is that one necessarily suffers in regard to one's beloved what one suffers in regard to food, through having more than one's fill. The friendship of the soul, because of being chaste, is also less likely to be sated, although it is not thereby, as someone might suppose, also less graced by Aphrodite.[104] Rather, the prayer in which we beseech the goddess to grant her grace to our words and deeds is clearly fulfilled. (16) The soul that blossoms with a liberal bodily appearance and a bashful, well-born character and that, from the outset, is capable of leading its peers while being at the same time of a friendly disposition—that such a soul cherishes and has a friendly love of the beloved requires no further argument. And that it is likely for such a lover to be loved in return by the boy I shall now teach.

(17) "Who could hate that person by whom, in the first place, he knows he is thought to be a gentleman; when, second, he sees that the person is more serious about the noble beauties of the boy than his own pleasure; when, in addition, he trusts that the friendship would not diminish, whether he were to lose his youthful bloom or, through illness, to become less attractive in bodily form? (18) To those, indeed, for whom friendly love is something shared, how could it not of necessity be the case that they look upon one another with pleasure, that they converse together benevolently, that they trust and are trusted, that they take thought for one another, that they rejoice together at noble actions and become vexed together if some misfortune should cross their path? How could it not be that they live their lives contentedly whenever they are together in good health and are together all the more if one or the other of them takes ill, and care for one another when absent still more than when present? Are not all these the things graced by Aphrodite? It is, at any rate, through such deeds that they live out their lives to old age being lovers of the friendship and making use of it.

(19) "But why would the boy return the love of one attached only to the body? Would it be because the lover allots to himself the things that he desires and to the boy the most disgraceful things? Or is it that, on account of what he is eager to do with the boy, he keeps the

[104] Cf. nn. 34 and 62 above.

beloved's relatives from him most of all? (20) The lover, moreover, who does not use force but persuasion is for this reason to be hated all the more, since by resorting to force he displays his own wretchedness, but by persuading he corrupts the soul of the one who is seduced. (21) And does the one who sells his youthful bloom for money love the buyer any more than does the seller who hawks his wares in the marketplace? Indeed, the boy will not feel a friendly affection for the lover because he, in his bloom, associates with one who is not, nor because he is beautiful and the lover is no longer so, nor because he, who is not in love, associates with one who is. For the boy doesn't even share in the gratifications of sex[105] as does a woman with a man, but watches, stone-cold sober, the one intoxicated by sexual gratification. (22) It would be no wonder if, as a result, he comes to feel contempt for his lover. And one might discover, in examining this, that while nothing harsh has arisen from those loved for their character, already many impious things have been done as a result of this shameless association.

(23) "I'll now make clear that the association is illiberal for the one loving the body rather than for the one loving the soul. For he who teaches what ought to be said and done would justly be honored as Cheiron and Phoenix were by Achilles. But he who yearns for the body would fittingly be treated as a beggar: he is always shadowing the boy, pleading for and needing still another kiss or some other caress. (24) If I speak rather bluntly, don't be amazed, for the wine is urging me on, and the Eros that always dwells with me goads me into speaking freely regarding the Eros that is its opponent. (25) For in my opinion, the person who applies his mind to the form[106] is akin to one who has rented land: he does not tend to it so that it may become more valuable, but so that he may harvest as many blooms as possible. But the person who seeks out friendship is more akin to one who possesses the family fields: he brings, that is, whatever he can from everywhere and makes the beloved more valuable. (26) Among the beloveds, moreover, he who knows that, by offering up his bodily form, he'll rule the lover, will in all likelihood act corruptly in other respects. But the beloved who recognizes that he will not retain

[105] Literally, "the things belonging to (or characteristic of) Aphrodite" (see nn. 34 and 62).

[106] The word is *eidos* ("form," "class," or "kind").

the friendship unless he is a gentleman is likely to care more for virtue. (27) But the greatest good for one yearning to make of his beloved a good friend is that he himself must practice virtue, for one who does wretched things himself cannot make the one he is with good, nor can one exhibiting shamelessness and incontinence make the beloved continent and bashful.

(28) "And I desire, Callias, to tell you a tale that shows that not only human beings but gods and heroes as well value more the friendship of the soul than the use of the body. (29) For all the mortal women whose bodily form Zeus loved, these he left as mortals after having associated with[107] them. But all the men whose good souls he might cherish, these he made immortal, among whom are Heracles and the Dioscuroi,[108] and there are said to be others. (30) And I assert that even Ganymede[109] was borne up to Olympus by Zeus not for the sake of his body but of his soul. Even his name offers evidence of this. For there is, I think, in Homer,

and he rejoices in hearing.[110]

This means, 'he takes pleasure in hearing.' There is also somewhere else,

knowing shrewd schemes in his mind.[111]

This in turn means, 'knowing wise deliberations in his mind.' So on the basis of these two together, the one called 'Ganymede' was honored among the gods not for the pleasure of his body but for that of his judgment.[112] (31) Furthermore, Niceratus, Homer has portrayed Achilles as avenging in a most outstanding way the death of Patrocles—presented as his comrade, not his beloved. And Orestes, Py-

[107] See n. 20 above.

[108] "Dioscuroi" literally means "the sons (or youths) of Zeus," namely Castor and Polydeuces.

[109] A very young boy, renowned for his beauty, taken by Zeus to be his cupbearer and beloved. See, e.g., *Iliad* 20.231ff.; Theognis 1345ff.; Plato *Phaedrus* 255c; *Laws* 636c–d.

[110] The phrase does not appear in the extant writings of Homer.

[111] The line as quoted does not appear in Homer (cf., e.g., *Iliad* 17.325).

[112] Socrates' etymology is untranslatable. He suggests that "Gany-" means "rejoice" or "takes pleasure in" and "-mede" means "schemes" or "deliberations." Thus the boy's very name suggests "taking pleasure in deliberations," a cerebral activity to be sure.

lades, Theseus, Peirithous, and many other of the best demigods are praised in song as having accomplished in common the greatest and noblest things, not on account of having slept together but rather of their admiration for one another.

(32) "What then? Might not someone discover that all present-day noble deeds are done by those willing to toil and run risks for the sake of commendation rather than by those accustomed to choose pleasure before good repute? And yet Pausanias[113], the lover of Agathon the poet, in making a defense on behalf of those who wallow together in incontinence, said that the stoutest army could be made up of beloveds and their lovers. (33) For he said that he supposes these especially would be ashamed to abandon one another. What amazing things he says, if in fact those who are accustomed to paying no heed to reproach and who act shamelessly with one another would be especially ashamed at doing something shameful! (34) He adduced as evidence the Thebans and the Eleans as ones who've recognized these things. He said that although they sleep with their beloveds, they nevertheless arrange them alongside themselves in battle. But there is nothing relevant in what he said, for while these things are customs among them, among us they are subject to the greatest reproach. In my opinion, at least, those who make these arrangements seem to doubt whether, once left alone, their beloveds will carry out the deeds of noble men. (35) But by believing that if someone has even longed for the body, he'll no longer attain anything noble and good, the Lacedaemonians make their beloveds so completely good that they are ashamed to leave those around them, whether they are with foreigners or even if they are not stationed in the same city[114] as their lover. For they believe that not Shamelessness but Shame[115] is a goddess.

(36) "Now in my opinion, we would all be in agreement as to what I'm saying if we were to examine the following question: to a boy loved in which of the two ways would someone be more inclined to entrust for safe keeping his money, children, or a debt of gratitude? I think that even the person who uses the beloved's form would entrust all these things more to one with a comely soul. (37)

[113] In Plato's *Symposium*, it is Phaedrus who makes the argument indicated (see 178a6ff.).

[114] Reading *polei* with the mss. instead of Ollier's *taksei* ("line of battle").

[115] Or, "Bashfulness."

Indeed, Callias, it is in my opinion a worthy thing for you to feel gratitude to the gods because they have instilled in you a love of Autolycus. For that he is a lover of honor[116] is quite clear, he who endured many toils and much pain for the sake of being proclaimed the victor in the pancratium. (38) If he should suppose that he will adorn not only himself and his father, but also that he will become capable, through manly goodness, of doing good to his friends and of augmenting the fatherland by erecting trophies against its enemies—and that through these things his face and his name will be known among both Greeks and barbarians—how can you not suppose that he would treat with the greatest honors anyone he considered to be the most excellent helpmate in such things? (39) So if you wish to be pleasing to him, you must consider the sorts of things Themistocles knew so as to be capable of liberating Greece; you must consider whatever in the world were the sorts of things Pericles knew so as to be held to be a most excellent counselor to the fatherland, and to examine how in the world Solon had philosophized before he laid down most excellent laws for the city; you must also search out the sorts of things the Lacedaemonians practice such that they are held to be most excellent leaders—the most excellent among them are always brought to your home as ambassadors. (40) Know well, then, that the city would quickly entrust itself to you, if you so wish. For the greatest things belong to you: you are of a good family,[117] a priest of the gods descended from Erechtheus[118], gods who led the army under Iacchus[119] against the Barbarian. And now in the festival you make an appearance as priest that is more impressive than your ancestors. Your body too is the worthiest in the city to behold and is capable of bearing up under hardship.

(41) "If in the opinion of you all I am speaking more seriously than is appropriate with a view to drinking, don't marvel at it. For I spend my days as one who is always, together with the city, a fellow lover

[116] Or, "ambitious."

[117] Literally, "you are a Eupatrides," the name of the Athenians of the first class.

[118] A legendary king of Athens reared by Athena (*Iliad* 2.547ff.). Cf. *Memorabilia* 3.5.10.

[119] In this context, the name may refer to Dionysus himself; see Walter Burkert, *Griechische Religion der archaischen und Klassichen Epoche* (Mainz: W. Kohlhammer, 1977), 127.

of those who are by nature good and who seek out virtue ambitiously."

(42) Now as the others were discussing what had been said, Autolycus was observing Callias. And Callias, while watching the boy out of the corner of his eye, said, "Surely, then, Socrates, you'll act as a pimp for me in regard to the city so that I may tend to its affairs and always be pleasing to it?"

(43) "Yes, by Zeus!" he said. "If, that is, they see that you really do care for virtue and not merely seem to.[120] For false reputation is soon refuted by the test of experience, but true manly goodness, unless a god hinders it, always supplies a more brilliant fame when put into practice."

CHAPTER 9

(1) Here this speech came to a close. Autolycus got up from his seat to go for a walk, as it was then his time to do so. His father Lycon, leaving with him, turned and said, "By Hera, Socrates, you are in my opinion a noble and good human being."[121]

(2) After this, a sort of throne was set down in the room, and the Syracusan then came in. He said, "Men, Ariadne will enter the chamber she shares with Dionysus. After this, Dionysus will enter, having drunk a little with the gods, and he will come to her. They will then be playful with one another."

(3) After this, Ariadne entered, adorned as a bride, and sat down on the throne. While Dionysus had not yet appeared, a Bacchic rhythm was played on the flute. It was at this point that they admired the dance instructor, for as soon as Ariadne heard this, she acted in such a way that all could see she listened with pleasure. She did not go to meet him, nor even get up, but it was clear that she was still only with difficulty. (4) When Dionysus espied her, he danced

[120] The verb translated as "to seem" (*dokein*) is related to the word translated as "reputation" (*doxa*) in the next sentence.

[121] Or, "gentleperson"; Lycon substitutes "human being" (*anthrōpos*) for "man" (*anēr*) in the customary formula elsewhere translated as "gentleman" (see nn. 2 and 16 above).

over to her, sat down on her lap as one would in the most affectionate[122] way, took her in his arms, and kissed her. And although she seemed bashful, she nevertheless affectionately embraced him in return. When the banqueters saw this, they clapped as they shouted, "Encore!" (5) Then, when Dionysus had stood up and helped Ariadne rise alongside him, one could behold them assuming the poses of those kissing and embracing one another. When the onlookers saw that Dionysus really was noble and that Ariadne was in her bloom, and that the two were not playing at kissing one another but were genuinely kissing with their mouths, all were carried away. (6) For they heard Dionysus ask her if she loved[123] him, and she vowed that she did in such a way that not only Dionysus[124] but all those present too would have sworn an oath that the boy and the girl were loved by one another. For they appeared not to have learned their poses as a routine, but rather to have been permitted to do what they had long been desiring. (7) Finally, when the banqueters saw that they had embraced one another and were off to their marriage bed, those who were unmarried swore that they would marry, and those who were married mounted their horses and rode off to their wives so as to obtain these things. Socrates and the others who remained went off with Callias to walk with Lycon and his son.

Such was the conclusion of this banquet.

[122] *Philikōtata*": an adverb related to the word for "friend" and hence also to the verb meaning "to kiss" which appears at the end of the sentence (see also n. 58 above).

[123] Here and again at the end of this sentence, the verb is *philein* (see n. 58 above).

[124] Ollier, following Shenkl (*Xenophontis Opera*, [Berlin: Weidman, 1869]) suggests a lacuna at this point.